

2 Source interpretation questions and marking instructions

Issue 1

Source C: from Michael Lynch *Scotland: A New History* (1992)

“In 1836, a census made by the minister of the Gaelic congregation in Glasgow established that there were 22,000 Highlanders in the city, but this was almost certainly an underestimate because of the seasonal nature of their search for work to make money as their crofts were becoming so unproductive. Migrants from the Highlands were the young and single, both male and female, and increasingly, male heads of the poorest households among the crofters and cottars. Migration provided a safety valve for these groups who always, at best, lived on the margin of economic survival scraping a living on unproductive land. Migration depended, however, on the availability of work and it was fortunate that the worst years of famine coincided with the expansion of job opportunities, especially in railway construction, labouring for men and domestic service for girls.”

Source D: from Marjory Harper *Crossing Borders: Scottish emigration to Canada*

“Highland emigrants were driven to leave Scotland for economic and social reasons other areas of Scotland saw very different pressures. Rural Lowlanders had been attracted to Canada because it offered independent owner-occupation of land, in direct contrast to the lack of farming opportunities at home. The steady commercialisation of Lowland agriculture had been frustrating the landholding ambitions of small tenant farmers and farm labourers alike, as landlords sought to maximise production by creating ever bigger farms. In Canada, a good farm could be bought for the equivalent of a year’s rent at home, such a step bringing economic betterment for their families. Scots also had a reputation as good farmers so were actively sought by the Canadian government to work as farmers on the open and fertile spaces in that rich land.”

Question 3. How much do **Sources C** and **D** agree about differing interpretations of the economic reasons why Scots migrated? **10**

(Use the Sources and recalled knowledge to explain your answer)

Overall Source C emphasises the problems of working the land in the Highlands as a reason for migration.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> there were 22,000 Highlanders in the city, but this was almost certainly an underestimate because of the seasonal nature of their search for work to make money as their crofts were becoming so unproductive. 	Illustrates that the pressure on land in the Highlands forced Highland crofters to undertake seasonal work in urban centres.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Migration provided a safety valve for these groups who always, at best, lived on the margin of economic survival, scraping a living on unproductive land. 	Shows how migration had a role in reducing the impact/poverty of working on increasingly unproductive land.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Migration depended on the availability of work and it was fortunate that the worst years of famine coincided with the expansion of job opportunities, especially in railway construction, labouring for men and domestic service for girls. 	Illustrates that migration was only effective if a variety of work existed in urban centres such as Glasgow
Overall Source D emphasises the attractions of working abroad owing to the lack of opportunities at home.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lowlanders had also been attracted to Canada because it offered independent owner-occupation of land, in direct contrast to the lack of farming opportunities at home. 	Illustrates the pull factor of work abroad as an economic factor in migration.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In Canada, a good farm could be bought for the equivalent of a year's rent at home, such a step bringing economic betterment for their families. 	Shows the affordability and economic attraction of farming abroad.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Scots also had a reputation as good farmers so were actively sought by the Canadian government to work as farmers on the open and fertile spaces in that rich land 	Illustrates the attraction of Scots workers/farmers for governments abroad owing to the fact they were skilled in what they did as farmers.

Possible points of recall to contextualise the sources.

- The Highland Clearances saw crofters and tenants cleared off the land to make way for sheep and deer farms, which were economically more productive for the landowners.

- Collapse of the fishing trade in after 1917 saw many men who worked on the trawlers as well as women who supported them losing their jobs.
- Rural life was difficult with long hours and backbreaking work. Towns offered more pay for a simpler job with regulated hours.
- Mechanisation of Agriculture forced people to move, Steam power led to the introduction of threshing machines, and by the 1870s harvesting in the Lowlands of Scotland was a largely mechanical operation requiring far fewer hands on the farm.
- Examples of the deliberate activities of places like Canada to attract Scottish workers/farmers due to their skills. i.e. the British American Land Company bought one million acres of land in the Canadian province of Quebec and they needed people to work the land hence an active recruitment policy that targeted the Outer Hebrides, etc.
- Other Factors

Issue 2

Source B: from Martin J. Mitchell (ed.) *New Perspectives on The Irish In Scotland* (2008)

The main view about the Catholic Irish in nineteenth century Scotland is that they were despised by the bulk of the native population, and as a result formed separate and isolated communities. Although there was some hostility to the Catholic Irish on religious grounds, many incidents were not of a sectarian character-they were disturbances against the Irish, both Catholic and Protestant- as strike-breakers. Indeed, there was comparatively little open popular hostility towards the immigrant presence. Indeed, there is evidence which suggests that members of the Catholic Irish community enjoyed good relations with some Scottish workers in the Trade Union movement and in fact associated with them to a considerable extent. This was also true of Temperance organisations that combatted the evil of drink.

Source C: adapted from Ian Van Geical; *Prejudice in Scottish Society* (1948)

Although the experience of the Irish in Scotland can be seen as a success from the perspective of today there is no doubt that they suffered throughout the 19th Century and into the early 20th century. There was real prejudice from the Protestant Scots who felt that such large numbers of Catholic Irish immigrants could not be easily assimilated into Scottish society. There was a genuine fear of Catholics and active hostility to the threat of 'Popery' in Scotland. Faced with this hostility and as they were willing to work for low wages the Irish ended up living together in the poorer areas of Scotland's cities. One example is Dundee, where there were 14,000 Irish immigrants by 1855, most of whom stayed in Lochee, or 'Little Tipperary' as it would come to be known.

2. How much do Sources **B** and **C** reveal about differing interpretations of the experience of immigrant Irish in Scotland.

10

Overall Source B gives a generally positive view of the experience of the immigrant Irish in Scotland integrating relatively well with the Scots with just some religious animosity.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although there was some hostility to the Catholic Irish on religious grounds, many incidents were not of a sectarian character-they were disturbances against the Irish, both Catholic and Protestant- as strike-breakers. 	Shows that most differences between the Irish and locals were economic rather than religious.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> there was comparatively little open popular hostility towards the immigrant presence. 	Shows that open prejudice to Irish Immigrants was not common
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> members of the Catholic Irish community enjoyed good relations with some Scottish workers in the Trade Union movement and in fact associated with them to a considerable extent. 	Illustrates areas where the Scots and Irish worked together and assimilated to some extent.
Overall Source C emphasises the negative experience of the Irish in Scotland illustrating popular prejudice to them as poor and a danger to Scottish society.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There was real prejudice from the Protestant Scots who felt that such large numbers of Catholic Irish immigrants could not be easily assimilated into Scottish society. 	Shows that one fear was the large number of Irish Catholic immigrants and their integration with the indigenous Scots.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There was a genuine fear of Catholics and active hostility to the threat of 'Popery' in Scotland. 	Illustrates the prejudice amongst Protestants against Catholics.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Faced with this hostility and as they were willing to work for low wages the Irish ended up living together in the poorer areas of Scotland's cities. 	Shows that immigrants experienced economic inequality, which made them live together encouraging further hostility.

Possible points of recall

- Mixed marriages between Catholics and Protestants became more common as the century progressed, particularly in smaller communities where the choice of marriage partners was less.
- The Catholic Church took steps to develop Catholic organisations and institutions (eg Celtic FC) to develop a distinct Catholic community.
- Pius X's "Ne Temere" decree of 1908 on invalid marriages applied to every marriage of a Catholic, even when marrying someone who was not of his or

her faith; this caused much heartache amongst non-Catholics who felt they were continually losing out.

- The 1918 Education Act led to the establishment of Catholic schools showing further separation between Catholic and Protestant.
- In the 1920s the Church of Scotland became overtly hostile to Roman Catholicism.
- As the Scottish economy collapsed in the 1920s and 1930s, workplace discrimination against Catholics grew.
- The Protestant Irish assimilated more easily into Scottish society.
- Most immigrant groups suffered minor harassment at various times, both from native Scots and from other immigrant groups.
- Immigrants in Glasgow particularly suffered alongside the poorer sections of native society from the epidemics of mid-century.
- By the 1890s, both Catholic and Protestant Irish were gaining apprenticeships and beginning to move up the social ladder.

Issue 3

Source A: from Dr Rebecca Lenihan, *Alba to Aotearoa: New Zealand's Scottish migrants, 1840-1920* [2015]

Scottish culture is widespread in New Zealand, for example, in our tendency to say 'wee' when we mean small, and our frequent inclusion of Auld Lang Syne to conclude ceremonies. In fact New Zealand's enthusiastic celebration of New Year's Eve, and our public holidays on 1 and 2 January, are also inherited from our Scottish ancestors and their celebration of Hogmanay. On 25 January, let us raise a glass in memory of Robert Burns—or a cup of tea in memory of his nephew the Reverend Thomas Burns, a founder of Dunedin—and to that quarter of New Zealand's early European migrants who came from Scotland and helped to shape the nation we know today. One major and positive impact is on the land of New Zealand. Scottish settlers farming skills led to the development of famous products which we exported round the world, like New Zealand lamb.

Source B: from Norman Zealand, *The Fern and the Thistle* (2018).

Far from being a completely positive influence, we have to remember that some Scots in New Zealand have been responsible for the destruction of the countryside. In their desire for farm land Scots emigrants who settled around Otago cut down all the trees that they could find. It would take extensive reforestation in the twentieth century to reverse this trend. Although we enjoy Scottish customs and culture today it should be remembered that in imposing their festivals the Scots effectively destroyed those of the local Maori people they came upon. Traditional sacred beliefs, known as Tapu by the Maoris, were replaced by the Christian beliefs of the Church of Scotland. Again, it has taken time for the Maori identity to flower and grow into the vibrant state it is in today. Well-meaning Scottish missionaries in seeking to educate local people in Scottish culture, such as Robbie Burns, effectively destroyed an ancient culture as Maori language was replaced by English.

Question 1: How much do Sources **A** and **B** reveal about differing interpretations of the impact of Scots on New Zealand. **10**

Overall **Source A** sees the impact of the Scots on New Zealand in a positive way culturally and economically.

- Scottish culture is widespread in New Zealand, for example, in our tendency to say 'wee' when we mean small, and our frequent inclusion of Auld Lang Syne to conclude ceremonies. In fact New Zealand's enthusiastic celebration

Illustrates Scottish impact positively in terms of cultural festivals and language saying that New Zealander's are enthusiastic about these ceremonies.

of New Year's Eve, and our public holidays on 1 and 2 January, are inherited from our Scottish ancestors and their celebration of Hogmanay.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> On 25 January, let us raise a glass in memory of Robert Burns—or a cup of tea in memory of his nephew the Reverend Thomas Burns, a founder of Dunedin—and to that quarter of New Zealand's early European migrants who came from Scotland and helped to shape the nation we know today. 	Shows literary impact and how Scots shaped the nation of New Zealand.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One major and positive impact is on the land of New Zealand. Scottish settlers farming skills led to the development of famous products which we exported round the world, like New Zealand lamb. 	Illustrates impact on farming and in a positive way as it enhances the New Zealand economy.
Overall Source B sees the impact of the Scots on New Zealand in a more complex and negative way in terms of land, education and culture.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Far from being a completely positive influence, we have to remember that some Scots in New Zealand have been responsible for the destruction of the countryside. In their desire for farm land Scots emigrants who settled around Otago cut down all the trees that they could find. 	Shows a different side to Scots impact on land by looking at the ecological rather than economic impact on the land.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> in imposing their festivals the Scots effectively destroyed those of the local Maori people they came upon. Traditional sacred beliefs, known as Tapu by the Maoris, was replaced by the Christian beliefs of the Church of Scotland. 	Illustrates the negative impact of Scottish festivals, especially on the native peoples of New Zealand as their belief system was challenged.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Well-meaning Scottish missionaries in seeking to educate local people in Scottish culture, such as Robbie Burns, effectively destroyed an ancient culture as Maori language was replaced by English. 	Shows how indigenous culture was impacted on by the incoming Scots in a negative way as Maori language replaced by English.

Possible points of recall

- Scots founded New Zealand's paper-making industry and were important engineers and shipbuilders.
- Peter and David Duncan, originally from Forfar, developed a successful business in Agricultural implements in Christchurch.
- Importance in medicine: New Zealand's first medical school was founded in Otago in 1875, the dean of medicine, John Scott, and the professor of physiology, John Malcolm, were both Scots.
- The earliest studies of New Zealand's geology were the work of Scots, or scientists of Scottish descent: James Park, James Hector, Charles Cotton, Allan Thomson, James Bell and Alexander McKay.
- Scots were in right at the start of political life in New Zealand. James Busby, the first British Resident, was a Scot. So was Andrew Sinclair, colonial secretary in the 1840s.
- Of greatest influence in the mid-19th century was the Highlander Donald McLean. A government official and politician, McLean played a key role in the developing relationship between European settlers and Māori, and secured Māori land for settlement.
- In the later Liberal government of Sir Joseph Ward, five out of ten cabinet ministers were Scottish.
- the Presbyterian Church in New Zealand was known as 'the Scotch Church'.
- Settlement and setting up of Dunedin
- Role in Maori Wars

reasons.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Prices for Jute fell after the war and employment levels in the Jute industry in Scotland fell between 1929 and 1939. 	Illustrates impact on unemployment figures.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As workers in India could be employed far more cheaply than in Scotland it was logical that those who owned Dundee's Jute mills would shift their investment to that country. 	Shows that cheap workers in India led to investment loss for Scottish mills.

Question 4: How much do Sources **C** and **D** reveal about differing interpretations of the impact of the Empire on Scotland **10**

From recall

- Exemplification of firms and individuals who made fortunes, such as Clyde shipbuilders like Napier's, John Brown's and Beardmore's.
- Scotland exported to the Empire in great quantities: Springburn, produced one quarter of the world's locomotives in 1914.
- Scots exploited employment opportunities offered by Empire: Scottish middle-class boys had successful careers, especially in India, as civil servants, doctors and as soldiers.
- Scottish investors pioneer use of 'investment trusts' where professional managers enabled large numbers of modest investors to gain access to the rewards of large-scale investment. Cities like Edinburgh, Dundee and Aberdeen came to hold extensive investments abroad.
- Investment a double edged sword as it also meant that capital left Scotland to finance projects abroad.
- Importance of commerce and Empire left Scotland vulnerable to(?) international trade slumps
- Low-wage economy encouraged in Scotland by export market led to considerable poverty for many with associated problems of poor housing, etc
- Empire also allowed for the development of a skilled, literate working-class in engineering, etc
- Empire encouraged Scottish martial tradition: eg; Sir Charles Napier and Sir Colin Campbell in India

Other relevant factors