

Higher History – Issue 1: The Migration of Scots

Source Questions - 'How Fully...?' Questions

Source A: from James Hunter, *The Last of the Free* (1999) (NH 2015)

It is unarguable that following the collapse of the kelp trade landlords were looking for change. Many landlords were of the view, by the 1840s, that it could only be of benefit to them to rid their land and properties of people. They attempted to do this following the hardship of the famine period, perhaps the most far-reaching occurred on Barra, South Uist and Benbecula. Those islands belonged to John Gordon of Cluny. Gordon chartered a fleet of five ships in order to transport 1,700 people from his Hebridean properties to Canada. Similarly, other landlords contributed to the cost of fares to encourage families to emigrate. More than 16,000 people were helped to emigrate from the Highlands and Islands between 1847 and 1857.

1. How fully does **Source A** explain the reasons for Scottish migration?
Use the **Source and recalled knowledge**

(10)

When answering this type of question remember **AID**

Marks	What you need to do:	A - answer
ONLY 2 marks awarded to an answer that doesn't make a judgement	MAKE A JUDGEMENT! Decide if source fully describes/explains HINT - no source will ever fully describe/explain.	<i>Source A only partly explains the reasons for Scottish migration.</i>
Up to 4 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source does say/tell you. Do not just quote - you must explain why each point is relevant. Re-write the fact in your own words and then include the quote to prove your point	I - include <i>The source explains that one reason for Scottish migration was "following the collapse of the kelp trade landlords were looking for change." This explains that people had to leave as the landlords wanted to find other uses for their land which bring them more profits. Another reason the source identifies is...</i>
Up to 7 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source has left out/doesn't tell you. Again you must show that you are making a judgement that it has left information out!	D - doesn't However, Source A fails to describe/explain that...

Source B: from Marjory Harper, *Adventurers and Exile: The Great Scottish Exodus*

Farm-workers' mobility was provoked not only by the implications of farm consolidation, which dashed the hopes of many who wanted to become small tenant farmers, but also by the threat and reality of permanent landlessness and changes in accommodation that saw farm workers housed in squalid bothies.

At the same time, the profile of Highland migration changed significantly. The distinction between temporary and permanent relocation became increasingly blurred, as migrants postponed their return for months or even years, impelled often by the acute need to earn money to pay the rent at home.

For both Highlanders and rural Lowlanders, the burgeoning industrial towns provided the main stimulus to migrate, thanks to higher wages and the perception of better conditions than in farming or crofting.

2. How fully does **Source B** explain the reasons for the migration of Scots?
Use the **Source and recalled knowledge**

(10)

Marks	What you need to do:	The structure for your answer
ONLY 2 marks awarded to an answer that doesn't make a judgement	MAKE A JUDGEMENT! Decide if source fully describes/explains HINT - no source will ever fully describe/explain.	<i>Source A only partly explains the reasons for migration of Scots.</i>
Up to 4 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source does say/tell you. Do not just quote - you must explain why each point is relevant. Re-write the fact in your own words	The structure for your answer <i>The source explains that one reason for Scottish migration was "Farm-workers mobility was provoked not only by the implications of farm consolidation, which dashed the hopes of many who wanted to become small tenant farmers..."</i> <i>This explains that people had to because...</i> <i>Another reason the source identifies is...</i> <i>The source also tells us that...</i>
Up to 7 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source has left out/doesn't tell you. Again you must show that you are making a judgement that it has left information out!	The structure for your answer <i>However, the source does not fully explain the reasons for Scottish migration.</i> <i>Source A fails to describe/explain that...</i> <i>It also doesn't explain that....</i>

SOURCE C: from James Hunter, *Glencoe and the Indians* (1996) (OH 2013)

Incessant rain had made it impossible for the population of the west coast to harvest the peat on which they depended for domestic fuel. In this extremity the poor people were, in some place, forced to burn their huts and cottages. In such situations, the crofts to which the mass of Highlanders had been driven as a result of earlier clearances had long since proved incapable of providing adequately for their occupants. Crofting families survived on a diet consisting largely of potatoes. When that crop failed, as it did regularly, hunger became a severe problem. Landlords, practically none of whom now felt any responsibility for the Highlander's fate, simply organised more evictions in order to create still more sheep farms. People thus deprived of their crofts had little alternative but to go elsewhere.

3. How fully does **Source C** explain the reasons for the migration of Scots?

Use the **Source and recalled knowledge**

(10)

Marks	What you need to do:
ONLY 2 marks awarded to an answer that doesn't make a judgement	MAKE A JUDGEMENT! Decide if source fully describes/explains HINT - no source will ever fully describe/explain.
Up to 4 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source does say/tell you. Do not just quote - you must explain why each point is relevant. Re-write the fact in your own words and then include the quote to prove your point
Up to 7 marks	What you need to do: Explain what the source has left out/doesn't tell you. Again you must show that you are making a judgement that it has left information out!

Source D: from Old Statistical Account (Banffshire, Moray and Nairnshire) 1840. (OH 2014)

Some individuals from these parts went to North America, a few of whom returned and settled at home bringing bad news of the country which their imaginings had favoured to be the fairy land of wealth. Since that time those who would have gone to America, had the prospects been favourable, have preferred a home migration to the southern parts of Scotland. They preferred Glasgow and Paisley where the textile mills cry out for more workers. From this part of the north there is and always has been a constant pressure through lack of land and money. That pressure was lessened by the employment given in lowland farms during the harvest. From other places, those people made homeless by the arrival of sheep or from farming changes that need less folk to work have become adventurers reaching for wealth in the British capital, the East and West Indies and other parts of the Empire.

4. How fully **Source D** show the reasons for internal migration within Scotland?

Use the **Source and recalled knowledge**

(10)

Source E: from Jenni Calder, *Scots in Canada* (2003). (OH 2015)

Many of Canada's settlers left Scotland willingly to go to their chosen destination. The factors that influenced their choice were mixed. Dissatisfaction with circumstances at home and hope for a better life combined in varying proportions. Rising rent meant that those dependent on the land, especially in the Highlands, were struggling. One of the main arguments against emigration was that it drained Scotland of human and financial resources yet what fuelled hope for a better life? Those who had gone before wrote letters and literature offering advice to emigrants which began to be published. A key factor was the prospect of owning land on which to raise crops and stock. As Chambers's Edinburgh Journal put it in March 1834, "Canada offered the prospect of the poorest becoming a possessor of soil and comfortably settling his children"

5. How fully does **Source A** explain the reasons for the migration of Scots?

*Use the **Source and recalled knowledge***

(10)

‘Evaluate the usefulness...?’ Questions

Source A: from an article about emigration written by the editor of Chambers’ Journal, a popular weekly Scottish magazine, from 1872. (NH2016)

Canada continues to be a popular destination for Scots emigrants. Many Scots from the Highlands to the Lowlands have already taken up the opportunity of living abroad in places such as Ontario and Nova Scotia. Experienced farmers and skilled agricultural workers can earn far more overseas than they can here at home. The attraction of emigration to Canada is not simply this, but the familiarity and neighbourliness of living among fellow Scots who had already emigrated in the past. By far the biggest attraction is the confident prospect that the poorest may become landowners thereby earning sufficient to make a living and to comfortably settle one’s children.

1. Evaluate the usefulness of **Source A** as evidence of the reasons for the migration of Scots.

In making a judgement you should refer to:

- *the origin and possible purpose of the source*
- *the content of the source*
- *your own knowledge.*

(8)

Marks	What you have to do	The structure for your answer
	Decided useful or not - MAKE A JUDGEMENT	<i>Source B is partly useful as evidence of...</i>
1-4	Decide the extent of the usefulness of source by making a comment on the usefulness of WHO wrote it, WHEN it was written, WHY it was written, TYPE of source	<p><i>The author of the source was...and this useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The source was written/said....and this is useful/less useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The purpose of the source is/was to...this makes it more/less useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The source is a and this makes it more/less useful because....</i></p>
1-2	Explains what useful information that the source has. CONTENT	<i>The source is useful about... as it explains.../The source is useful about....as it tells us.../The source is useful about....as it has information about...</i>
1-3	Explain what the source is not telling us from your own KU OMISSION	<i>However, the source is not as useful as it does not tell us about..../The source has limits in its usefulness as it doesn't explain....</i>

Source B: is from Angus Nicholson, Canada's Special Immigration Agent in the Highlands of Scotland, 1875. (OH 2011)

All the competing Emigration Agencies formerly reported on, are still at work as actively as ever. The New Zealand and Australian authorities are particularly alert, the streets of every town and village being always well ornamented with their bills and posters offering free passages and other inducements to emigrants. Not only so, but nearly all newspapers being subsidised by means of their advertisements, are doing their full share in the same direction. It has to be noted that a considerable number of potential recruits have been diverted from Canada to New Zealand as a result of the latter's offer of free passages. It is extremely difficult for us to attract emigrants when these territories are offering free passages while we expect the emigrants to pay their own fares to Canada.

2. Evaluate the usefulness of **Source B** as evidence of the reasons for Scottish migration and emigration.

In making a judgement you should refer to:

- *the origin and possible purpose of the source*
- *the content of the source*
- *your own knowledge.*

(8)

Marks	What you have to do	The structure for your answer
	Decided useful or not - MAKE A JUDGEMENT	<i>Source B is partly useful as evidence of...</i>
1-4	Decide the extent of the usefulness of source by making a comment on the usefulness of WHO wrote it, WHEN it was written, WHY it was written, TYPE of source	<p><i>The author of the source was...and this useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The source was written/said....and this is useful/less useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The purpose of the source is/was to...this makes it more/less useful because...</i></p> <p><i>The source is a and this makes it more/less useful because....</i></p>
1-2	Explains what useful information that the source has. CONTENT	<i>The source is useful about... as it explains.../The source is useful about....as it tells us.../The source is useful about....as it has information about...</i>
1-3	Explain what the source is not telling us from your own KU OMISSION	<i>However, the source is not as useful as it does not tell us about.../The source has limits in its usefulness as it doesn't explain....</i>

Source C: a letter to the Congested District Board about the removal of the Sconser township on 10th November 1900

We are informed by Lord Hugh Douglas, the factor on the MacDonald estates, that with the authority of Lady MacDonald he was to have had a meeting with the crofters in the Sconser township on the 8th, at which he was to explain to them the proposals under consideration for their removal to Suishnish and Boreraig, with the assistance of the Congested District Board. Mr Douglas was to allow them to the 14th to consider proposals and to say whether or not they were willing to go to Suishnish and Boreraig ... As matters stand at present he can only speak somewhat vaguely on the subject. We think it very likely that before the crofters absolutely consent to remove it will be necessary to tell them exactly the area of ground at Suishnish and Boreraig, which will be set apart for each, and the pecuniary liabilities which they will have to undertake. ...

From our recent conversation with Sheriff Brand and yourself we are hopeful that the Congested Districts Board will treat this present case as an exceptional one and if possible bear the whole cost of the migration including the erection of fences and of dwelling houses for the crofters.

3. Evaluate the usefulness of **Source C** as evidence of the reasons for Scottish migration and emigration.

In making a judgement you should refer to:

- *the origin and possible purpose of the source*
- *the content of the source*
- *your own knowledge.*

(8)

Marks	What you have to do
	Decided useful or not - MAKE A JUDGEMENT
1-4	Decide the extent of the usefulness of source by making a comment on the usefulness of WHO wrote it, WHEN it was written, WHY it was written, TYPE of source
1-2	Explains what useful information that the source has. CONTENT
1-3	Explain what the source is not telling us from your own KU OMISSION

Source D: part of a letter from Godfrey MacKinnon, originally from Skye but now farming in Australia, to his friend John McDonald from Uist, dated 18 March 1864.

I had very hard work of it the first three years that I was in the country but now I can take it a little easier... I have done very well for all the time I have been in the Colony [Australia] compared to if I had been in Skye for the rest of my life, even if I lived for fifty years or more. I have got a beautiful piece of country and first rate stock of both, sheep, cattle and horses. I have gone to great expense with my sheep purchases. I even imported rams. It will pay me very well in a few years. I had a splendid amount of wool this season and I expect a better amount next year.

4. Evaluate the usefulness of **Source D** in explaining the opportunities that attracted so many Scots to emigrate.

In making a judgement you should refer to:

- *the origin and possible purpose of the source*
- *the content of the source*
- *your own knowledge.*

(8)