

**Source D:** from Ben Braber, *Jews in Glasgow, 1879–1939* (2007)

Jewish immigrants had, generally, a beneficial effect on Scottish society as a whole. And nowhere was this more evident than on the economy of Scotland, especially during the late nineteenth and twentieth century. Jewish leaders also made efforts to create a positive image of Jews in society by keeping their people away from general institutions of charity. In October 1880, the Glasgow Hebrew Philanthropic Society dealt with 67 cases, believed to be a large number at that time, while in comparison, during the following winter in total about 14,000 persons in Glasgow applied for poor relief.

Abraham Goldberg bought his first bale of cloth at the turn of the century and took it to his room-and-kitchen in the Gorbals to turn it into goods for sale to wholesalers, many Scots purchasing these products. It was the start of a multi-million pound business! And by 1927 half of all the grass for paper making imported to Britain was in the hands of Morris & Co. of Glasgow, a Jewish firm. Older Jewish settlers in Glasgow had been small shopkeepers and manufacturers such as opticians, instrument makers, jewellers, stationers and furniture makers.

**Source E:** from a letter to the '*Glasgow Herald*', a newspaper, 15 April 1929.

Nor are the prejudicial effects on the population confined to the spreading of crime and low standards of life—morally and socially. Objection is taken on economic grounds. Figures show the extra burden of pauperism thrown on the community by the Irish; and the same is true more or less in regard to other forms of charitable relief and unemployment benefit. Under the last heading there must be considered the Scottish workers rendered unemployed by the Irish immigrants, as well as the unemployed Irish themselves. It is in the poorest paid and unskilled occupations that these immigrants might be found. In short the economic burden thrown upon Scotland by Southern Ireland is an undeniable evil for which there must be a political remedy or measure of alleviation.

How much do sources D and E reveal about the differing interpretations of the economic impact immigrants had on Scotland.

10 marks

## Marking instructions

Candidates can gain marks in a number of ways up to a maximum of 10 marks. Award up to 6 marks (3 marks per source) for their interpretation of the viewpoints from the sources (including establishing the overall viewpoint of each source).

Award up to 6 marks for recalled knowledge. Candidates can develop points from the sources and/or identify relevant points of significant omission.

<b>Points identified in source D</b>	<b>Possible comments which show the candidate has interpreted the significant view(s)</b>
Abraham Goldberg bought his first bale of cloth at the turn of the century and took it to his room-and-kitchen in the Gorbals to turn it into goods for sale to wholesalers, many Scots purchasing these products. It was the start of a multi-million pound business!	Success of various Jewish businessmen in becoming millionaires, for example Abraham Goldberg and this undoubtedly had a positive impact on the Scottish economy.
And by 1927 half of all the grass for paper making imported to Britain was in the hands of Morris & Co. of Glasgow, a Jewish firm.	Shows that Jewish businesses in Scotland grew to be significant on a national scale which was beneficial to the Scottish economy.
Older Jewish settlers in Glasgow had been small shopkeepers and manufacturers such as opticians, instrument makers, jewellers, stationers and furniture makers.	Jewish immigrants were successfully involved in wide-ranging and very profitable businesses which all created wealth for Scotland.
Jewish leaders also made efforts to create a positive image of Jews in society by keeping their people away from general institutions of charity.	Jewish community 'looks after' their own poor and the numbers are relatively low.
Overall viewpoint: Jewish immigrants had a significantly positive impact on the Scottish economy across a wide variety of businesses.	

Points identified in source E	Possible comments which show the candidate has interpreted the significant view(s)
Figures show the extra burden of pauperism thrown on the community by the Irish; and the same is true more or less in regard to other forms of charitable relief and unemployment benefit.	Shows how the Irish were particularly poor immigrants who relied upon the community, charities and government support which had a negative impact on the Scottish economy.
Under the last heading there must be considered the Scottish workers rendered unemployed by the Irish immigrants, as well as the unemployed Irish themselves.	Shows how the Irish were often hired as they worked for less pay resulting in more unemployment for Scots which had a seriously detrimental effect on the Scottish economy.
It is in the poorest paid and unskilled occupations that these immigrants might be found.	Shows how the majority of Irish workers were poorly educated, mainly working in unskilled manual labour roles which paid particularly badly. This was not a benefit to the Scottish economy.
Overall viewpoint: Irish immigrants added little economic value to Scotland's economy but instead put additional pressure on the Scottish economy as many Irish were extremely poor.	

**Points of significant omission include**

- Catholic Irish workers were accused of being strike-breakers which allows employers to continue making profits which benefits the overall economy.
- Much of the Scottish rail and road infrastructure was built by Irish Navvies which was a tremendous boost to the economy.
- The Jute industry in Dundee was particularly reliant on immigrants. This industry brought millions of pounds to the Scottish economy.
- The attractiveness of Edinburgh for professionals no doubt accounted for the large numbers of English in the city, but the latter were also involved in the industrial development of Scotland. It was English know-how and skill which was behind the development of the Scottish cotton industry. Many of the early skilled workers and managers were of English origin.
- There are many famous Italian businesses in Scottish society. Nardini's in Largs boasted a beautiful Art Deco tearoom that became an attraction for many Scots. Valvona & Crolla is a famous delicatessen based in Edinburgh. These examples are just some of the businesses which formed a key part of the Scottish economy in terms of catering.